

# ESTABLISHING THE NEED FOR TRADITIONAL SKILLS



### PURPOSE

This paper provides an analysis of the available data with a view to establishing from evidence what has been long understood in the construction and conservation sectors: that the condition of Scotland's traditional buildings is deteriorating. Throughout this paper, the terms 'pre-1919' and 'traditional' buildings are used interchangeably.

### SUMMARY

- There are approximately 2.35 million dwellings in total in Scotland of which some 455,000 (19%) were built before 1919. We refer to these as being traditionally constructed.
- Edinburgh and Glasgow have the largest number of pre-1919 buildings with approximately 69,000 each. The Shetland Islands and Western Isles have the lowest with approximately 2,000 properties each.
- 340,000 dwellings or 75% showed disrepair to critical elements; and 240,000 dwellings or 53% showed "urgent disrepair."
- About a third (150,000 dwellings) of the pre-1919 residential stock is rented, of which nearly three quarters is in the private rented sector.
- Buildings constructed after 1919 have a broadly similar disrepair profile to those constructed before 1919. However, they
  tend to have lower levels of disrepair.
- Approximately 167,000 repairs are made to critical elements of building fabric per year, alongside around 157,000 improvements. On average the expenditure on repairs in Scotland for pre-1919 dwellings is broadly the same as on improvements.
- Evidence suggests that non-residential buildings are at least in a similar if not worse state of repair as buildings in the residential sector.

### FINDINGS

- The need for repairs and subsequent maintenance is abundantly clear, the critical part is how to turn that need into demand and action.
- Private sector dwellings (owner occupied and private rented sectors) exhibit a higher need for repairs.
- Disrepair is found throughout Scotland but the problem is more acute in some areas than others.
- The problem is serious due to its impact on the fabric of traditional buildings as well as its geographic extent.
- There is no clear evidence that a shortage of funds is a major part of the problem: householders are willing to spend on interior/cosmetic improvements but seem less willing to spend on fundamental exterior repairs.
- The attitude of owners and occupiers of traditional buildings needs to change if condition is to improve.



75% of traditionally constructed dwellings exhibit disrepair to critical elements (Table 3 and Table 7)

## INTRODUCTION

Traditional buildings (those built before 1919) form an important part of Scotland's heritage. To ensure that they continue to contribute to Scotland's historic landscape it is important that the condition of traditional buildings is understood. This paper contains an analysis of the available data on condition to provide the evidence that supports measures to encourage owners to undertake appropriate repair and maintenance of traditional buildings.

### RESIDENTIAL SECTOR

The Scottish House Condition Survey (SHCS)<sup>1</sup> estimates that there are some 455,000 dwellings in Scotland built before 1919; and that there are approximately 2.35 million dwellings in total in Scotland, meaning the traditionally constructed sector accounts for about 19% of the total.

#### **Distribution of Traditional Buildings Across Scotland**

The proportion of traditional buildings varies quite substantially across Scotland, ranging from 3% of all properties in North Lanarkshire up to around 37% in the Orkney Islands.

#### Local Authority Area Percentage of Pre-1919 Dwellings

Lowest	
North Lanarkshire	3%
East Dunbartonshire	7%
West Lothian	7%
East Renfrewshire	8%
Falkirk	9%
Highest	
Dumfries and Galloway	31%
City of Edinburgh	32%
Moray	32%
Scottish Borders	33%
Orkney Islands	37%
Scotland	19%

 Table 1: The five Local Authorities with the lowest and highest proportion of pre-1919 properties.

In numeric terms, Edinburgh and Glasgow have equally large numbers of pre-1919 buildings with approximately 69,000 each. The Shetland Islands and Western Isles have the lowest with approximately 2,000 properties each.

## Key Message

Those considering how to address the demand for traditional building skills need to consider carefully the areas they might target: North Lanarkshire is unlikely to generate the same volume of work as Edinburgh. Orkney, however, may be able to provide sufficient work for local building contractors.



#### Condition of Traditionally Constructed Dwellings in Scotland

SHCS 2010 found that, of the 455,000 traditionally constructed dwellings:

- 340,000 dwellings or 75% showed disrepair to critical elements: that is, those elements whose condition is central to a dwelling being wind and weather proof, structurally stable and safeguarded against further rapid deterioration.<sup>2</sup>
- 240,000 dwellings or 53% showed "urgent disrepair": that is any disrepair which if not rectified would cause the fabric of the building to deteriorate further or place the health and safety of the occupier at risk. <sup>3</sup>

## KEY MESSAGE

The need for repair and subsequent maintenance of traditional buildings is abundantly clear, the critical part is how to turn that need into demand and action.



Failure of a render and associated stone decay caused by the use of incompatible cement based mortar.

#### **Condition of Pre-1919 Dwellings by Tenure**

About two thirds of the pre-1919 residential building stock in Scotland is in the rented sector. Of the 150,000 rented dwellings in Scotland a significant majority, nearly three quarters, is in the private rented sector. Tables 2a and 2b set out that:

- For the owner occupied sector, over 75% of dwellings have some critical disrepair and 53% show some form of urgent disrepair.
- For the social rented sector, over 64% of dwellings have some critical disrepair and 44% show some form of urgent disrepair.
- For the private rented sector, nearly 80% of dwellings have some critical disrepair and nearly 60% show some form of urgent disrepair.

#### 2a

Tenancy Type	Critical Disrepair 000s (%)	
Owner occupier	228 (75%)	
Social rented	26 (64%)	
Private rented	81 (79%)	

#### 2b

Tenancy Type	Urgent Disrepair 000s (%)		
Owner occupier	159 (53%)		
Social rented	18 (44%)		
Private rented	61 (59%)		

 Table 2a and 2b: Condition of pre-1919 buildings by tenure.

 Note: % figures are for buildings showing some disrepair.

## KEY MESSAGE

Private sector dwellings (owner occupied and private rented sectors) exhibit the most need for repair and maintenance.



#### Condition of Pre-1919 Dwellings by Local Authority Area

Local Authority Area	Critical Disrepair
Highest	
South Ayrshire	96%
South Lanarkshire	92%
Dundee City	92%
Renfrewshire	84%
Dumfries and Galloway	84%
Lowest	
Glasgow City	70%
Orkney Islands	70%
Moray	69%
Eilean Siar	60%
City of Edinburgh	59%
Scotland	75%

Table 3: Percentage of pre-1919 properties showing critical disrepair by local authority.

Local Authority Area	Urgent Disrepair		
Highest			
South Ayrshire	80%		
North Ayrshire	79%		
South Lanarkshire	70%		
Dumfries and Galloway	66%		
Scottish Borders	61%		
Lowest			
Aberdeenshire	45%		
Highland	44%		
Moray	43%		
Angus	42%		
Perth and Kinross	42%		
Scotland	53%		

Table 4: Percentage of pre-1919 properties showing urgent disrepair by local authority.

Note: For condition of pre-1919 dwellings by all Local Authority areas in Scotland, please see Annex 1.

- The proportion of dwellings showing critical disrepair elements is highest in South Ayrshire at 96% and lowest in the City of Edinburgh at 59%.
- The proportion of dwellings showing urgent disrepair elements is highest in South Ayrshire at 80% and lowest in Perth and Kinross at 42%.

## KEY MESSAGE

Disrepair is found throughout Scotland but the problem is more acute in some areas.

There is little difference between the condition of traditionally constructed buildings in rural versus urban areas.

#### The Main Types of Disrepair

The disrepair elements that are present in the greatest number and proportion of pre-1919 households are those which will lead to the most rapid deterioration in building condition.

Disrepair Element	Number of Households	Proportion of Households	
External wall finish	183,000	54%	
Primary roof structure	177,000	53%	
Roof gutters and downpipes	138,000	41%	
Chimney stacks	127,000	38%	
Flashings	108,000	32%	
External windows	84,000	25%	
Floor finish	70,000	21%	
External doors	53,000	16%	
Common doors, screens,			
windows and roof-lights	49,000	15%	
External wall structure	44,000	13%	
Secondary roof structure	21,000	6%	

Table 5: Number and proportion of pre-1919 households with different types of disrepair.

Buildings constructed since 1919 have a broadly similar disrepair element profile but the proportion of households with each disrepair element tends to be lower.

## KEY MESSAGE

The problem is serious due to its impact on the fabric of traditional buildings as well as its geographic extent.

#### Spending on Improvements, Repairs and Maintenance

Evidence from the SHCS suggests that approximately 167,000 repairs are made to critical elements of building fabric per year, alongside around 157,000 improvements. The level of expenditure on the average repair or improvement is about the same, which suggests that on average the expenditure on repairs in Scotland for pre-1919 dwellings is broadly the same as on improvements.

Evidence from SHCS suggests that the extent of disrepair is not a significant factor in determining whether an owner carries out a repair.

- Expenditure on improvements in buildings constructed after 1919 is generally at a similar level to those constructed pre-1919.
- Expenditure on repairs in buildings constructed after 1919 is generally around half of that for those constructed pre-1919.

### KEY MESSAGE

There is no clear evidence that a shortage of funds is a major part of the problem when householders are happy to spend on interior/cosmetic improvements not fundamental exterior repairs.



## KEY MESSAGE

The attitude of owners and occupiers of traditional buildings needs to change if condition is to improve.

### NON-RESIDENTIAL SECTOR

Evidence concerning the non-residential sector is harder to come by. There is no single comprehensive source of information akin to the Scottish House Condition Survey. There are, however, three sources of data available:

- The Buildings at Risk Register (BARR).
- Safeguarding Glasgow's Stone-built Heritage.
- The Scottish Small Towns Survey.

#### Analysis of the BARR

Analysis of the data underlying this indicator showed that in Summer 2012 there were 423 buildings that were regarded as being at risk in Scotland, of which 268 are non-residential. Of those, condition was assessed as good in 2% of cases, with the vast majority, 98%, assessed as being in the categories from fair through to ruinous. Over 63% of buildings were in poor, very poor or ruinous condition.

Looking at the 155 residential buildings on the register, for purposes of assessing the comparability with other condition assessments, condition was assessed as good in approximately 10% of cases, and categorised in fair through to ruinous in 90% of cases. Over 58% are in the categories of poor through to ruinous condition.

#### Analysis of Safeguarding Glasgow's Stone-built Heritage

Analysis of the data underpinning the Glasgow report (2006) suggests that 97% of stone buildings in Glasgow are in need of repair. More specifically, the surveyed facades indicated that of the 230 buildings surveyed:

- 33% of residential buildings and 40% of non-residential buildings have evidence of water penetration to the stone masonry.
- 21% of residential buildings and 41% of non-residential buildings require re-pointing to prevent water ingress.
- 26% of residential buildings and 38% of non-residential buildings require urgent maintenance to stone masonry if damage is to be avoided.
- 14% of residential buildings and 29% of non-residential buildings show damage to stone masonry due to the presence of salts, due either to saturation of stone by water or from the use of winter de-icing salts to base courses and entranceways.

#### Analysis of the Small Towns Survey

This report was compiled by the Scottish Small Towns Task Group in 2005/06 to provide evidence on issues being faced by small towns in Scotland. The report includes survey data on the condition of pre-1901 properties in seven settlements in the Scottish Borders. This survey covered 8% of pre-1901 buildings on the main streets of the settlements. Approximately 62% were domestic buildings and 38% were non-domestic. The survey reported that both non-domestic and domestic dwellings exhibited defects which include roof fabric failures, loose or falling masonry, gutter/downpipe defects, water ingress and window defects.

Type of High Priority Defect	Proportion of Surveyed Buildings with High Priority Defect		
Roof fabric	39%		
Falling masonry	45%		
Rainwater goods	31%		
Precipitation	17%		
Window	15%		

Table 6: Proportion of surveyed buildings with High Priority Defect.

On average about 70% of all traditionally constructed buildings were regarded as in a poor or dangerous condition or in a state of disrepair.



## KEY MESSAGE

These sources of condition data for non-residential traditional buildings suggest that these buildings are at least in a similar if not worse state of repair as residential traditional buildings.



### TRADITIONAL BUILDING SKILLS STRATEGY

The Scottish Government values our historic environment. It recognises the importance of traditional building skills to ensure this important sector plays its part in protecting the historic environment and supporting Scotland's economy.

The Scottish Government is committed to a swift and sustainable economic recovery in Scotland. Scottish Ministers consider that the provision of traditional skills can make an important contribution to the delivery of economic growth through employment within the construction sector and help sustain the Scottish built environment which forms the backdrop for so much economic activity.

In delivering this vision to support traditional building skills in Scotland, Historic Scotland will provide a strong and practical contribution to the Scottish Government's Economic Recovery Plan, the Energy Efficiency Action Plan and the Skills For Scotland Strategy.

Historic Scotland is in a unique position to drive this strategy forward with partner organisations. The stewardship role it has to play in protecting and enhancing our historic environment for future generations cannot be adequately achieved without the appropriate knowledge, skills and materials to conserve and maintain our traditional buildings.

Historic Scotland is one of the largest UK employers in the sector, providing training and employment through its conservation teams across Scotland.

Our vision is of a world-leading system of traditional skills training that meets the needs of a modern, innovative and competitive construction sector to ensure that it is equipped to fulfil its role in creating and maintaining Scotland's built environment of the future, and making a significant contribution to economic recovery.

Technical Conservation website: www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/conservation

### NOTES:

<sup>1</sup>The figures in this document relate to the SHCS 2010.

<sup>2</sup> Elements of critical disrepair consist of:

- Roof covering
- Roof structure
- Chimney stacksFlashings
- Roof gutters and downpipes
- External walls finish
- External walls structure
- Access decks and balustrades
- (common areas flats only)
- Foundations
- Damp-proof course
- External doors and windows (dwelling only)
- Doors, screens, windows and roof lights
- (common areas flats only)
- Party walls structure
   Floor structure
- Floor finish
- Dry rot/wet rot

<sup>3</sup> Urgency of disrepair is only assessed for external and common elements.

### ANNEX 1

Table showing pre-1919 buildings showing disrepair to critical elements; and those showing urgent disrepair for all Local Authority areas in Scotland.

Local Authority Area	Authority Area Disrepair to Critical Elements (000s)		Urgent Disrepair (000s)	
	(	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	(0	
Aberdeen City	15	(78%)	10	(54%)
Aberdeenshire	16	(77%)	9	(45%)
Angus	10	(79%)	5	(42%)
Argyll and Bute	9	(77%)	5	(48%)
Clackmannanshire	3	(82%)	2	(56%)
Dumfries and Galloway	17	(84%)	14	(66%)
Dundee City	10	(92%)	5	(47%)
East Lothian	6	(72%)	4	(50%)
City of Edinburgh	40	(59%)	36	(53%)
Eilean Siar	1	(60%)	1	(47%)
Fife	19	(77%)	13	(52%)
Glasgow City	48	(70%)	36	(53%)
Highland	13	(79%)	7	(44%)
Inverclyde	7	(75%)	4	(49%)
Midlothian	3	(76%)	3	(57%)
Moray	9	(69%)	5	(43%)
North Ayrshire	8	(83%)	7	(79%)
Orkney Islands	2	(70%)	2	(53%)
Perth and Kinross	15	(76%)	8	(42%)
Renfrewshire	10	(84%)	6	(53%)
Scottish Borders	14	(83%)	10	(61%)
Shetland Islands	2	(80%)	1	(58%)
South Ayrshire	10	(96%)	8	(80%)
South Lanarkshire	15	(92%)	12	(70%)
Stirling	7	(82%)	4	(47%)
West Dunbartonshire	5	(80%)	3	(57%)

 Table 7: Pre-1919 buildings showing critical and urgent disrepair by Local Authority Area (all).

Note: Figures not available for due to small sample sizes in the Scottish House Condition Survey for East Ayrshire, East Dunbartonshire, East Renfrewshire, Falkirk, North Lanarkshire, West Lothian Councils.